JR Facility Science Evaluation Panel (SEP) Meeting
9-11 January 2018
Scripps Institution of Oceanography, UCSD, La Jolla, CA

Meeting Roster

Science Subgroup

Natsue Abe                     Japan Agency for Marine-Earth Science and Technology (JAMSTEC)
Steven Bohaty                   National Oceanography Centre Southampton
David Bout                     University of Massachusetts Amherst
Christopher Charles            Scripps Institution of Oceanography, UCSD
Li-Hui Chen                    Nanjing University
Cristiano Chiessi              University of Sao Paolo
Bernard Coakley                University of Alaska
Deniz Cukur                    Korea Institute of Geoscience & Mineral Resources (KIGAM)
Matthew Fantle                  Pennsylvania State University
Sarah Feakins                  University of Southern California
Irina Filina                   University of Nebraska - Lincoln
Marguerite Godard              Université Montpellier
Michael Gurnis                 California Institute of Technology (Caltech)
Marc-André Gutscher            University of Brest – Institut Universitaire Europeen de la Mer
Ron Hackney                    Geoscience Australia
Ryota Hino                     Tohoku University
Samuel Jaccard                 University of Bern
Jens Kallmeyer                 GFZ German Research Centre for Geosciences
Hiroko Kitajima                Texas A&M University
Junichiro Kuroda               Japan Agency for Marine-Earth Science and Technology (JAMSTEC)
John Lewis                     Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Zhifei Liu                     Tongji University
Andrew McCaig                  University of Leeds
Ken Miller                     Rutgers The State University of New Jersey
Hajime Naruse                  Kyoto University
Yusuke Okazaki                 Kyushu University
Dhananjai Pandey               National Center for Antarctic and Ocean Research
Kevin Pickering                University College London
Jenny Pike                     Cardiff University
Werner Piller                  University of Graz
Brandi Reese                   Texas A&M University – Corpus Christi
Marci Robinson                 United States Geological Survey
Reed Scherer                   Northern Illinois University
Susanne Straub                 Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory - Columbia University
Hitoshi Tomaru                 Chiba University
Heiner Villinger               University of Bremen

Unable to attend
### Site Subgroup

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution/Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca Bell</td>
<td>Imperial College London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cara Burberry</td>
<td>University of Nebraska - Lincoln</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calvin Campbell</td>
<td>Geological Survey of Canada - Atlantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anil Chaubey</td>
<td>National Institute of Oceanography - India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gail Christeson</td>
<td>University of Texas at Austin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weiwei Ding</td>
<td>Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Elders</td>
<td>Curtin University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louis Géli</td>
<td>IFREMER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilles Guerin</td>
<td>Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory - Columbia University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sean Gulick</td>
<td>University of Texas at Austin (Co-Chair)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Iacopini¹</td>
<td>University of Aberdeen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priyank Jaiswal</td>
<td>Oklahoma State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kiichiro Kawamura</td>
<td>Yamaguchi University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seung-Sep Kim</td>
<td>Chungnam National University - Korea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank Nitsche²</td>
<td>Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory - Columbia University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michele Rebesco</td>
<td>Istituto Nazionale di Oceanografia e di Geofisica Sperimentale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Riedel</td>
<td>GEOMAR – Helmholtz Centre for Ocean Research Kiel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Derek Sawyer</td>
<td>The Ohio State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harold Tobin</td>
<td>University of Wisconsin - Madison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helenice Vital</td>
<td>Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Norte</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindsay Worthington</td>
<td>University of New Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guangfa Zhong</td>
<td>Tongji University</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Liaisons and Observers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution/Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamie Allan</td>
<td>National Science Foundation (NSF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamie Austin</td>
<td>IODP Forum Chair – University of Texas at Austin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donna Blackman</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carl Brenner</td>
<td>IODP US Science Support Program (USSSP) – LDEO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laurel Childress</td>
<td>JRSO - Texas A&amp;M University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dru Clark</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nobu Eguchi</td>
<td>JAMSTEC Center for Deep Earth Exploration (CDEX)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helen Feng</td>
<td>Independent Consultant to the SSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holly Given</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitty Haak</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry Katz</td>
<td>Chevron Corporation - EPSP (Chair)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adam Klaus</td>
<td>JRSO – TAMU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthony Koppers</td>
<td>JOIDES Resolution Facility Board Chair – Oregon State University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilles Lericolais</td>
<td>European Consort. for Ocean Res. Drilling (ECORD) Facility Board (Chair)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mitch Malone</td>
<td>JRFB Chair Elect - University of Notre Dame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sally Morgan</td>
<td>ECORD Science Office (ESO) – University of Leicester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthony Morris</td>
<td>Plymouth University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clive Neal</td>
<td>JRFB Chair Elect - University of Notre Dame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Olson</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christina Ravelo</td>
<td>Institute of Marine Sciences – UC Santa Cruz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angela Slagle</td>
<td>USSSP - LDEO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karen Stocks</td>
<td>IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Alternate for Rebecca Bell
² Alternate for Gilles Guérin
³ Alternate for Harold Tobin
1. **Welcome and Introductions**

Science Evaluation Panel (SEP) Co-Chair, Dr. Ken Miller, welcomed the SEP to Scripps Institution of Oceanography in La Jolla, CA.

1.1 *Call to order, panel charge, thanks to past members, and self-introductions*

Dr. Miller called the meeting to order with a welcome and provided a brief description of the panel's charge, a thanks to past members, and he asked attendees to perform self-introductions.

1.2 *Logistical Announcements*

Meeting host, Science Support Office Executive Director, Dr. Holly Given, reviewed the basic logistics for the meeting, including safety and Internet access.

1.3 *Approval of Meeting Agenda*

Dr. Miller asked the SEP members to review the agenda and provide changes or additions. No members presented additions or changes, and they approved the agenda.

2. **Reports from IODP Entities**

2.1 *Perspectives from the JRFB Chair*

*JOIDES Resolution* Facility Board (JRFB) Chair, Dr. Anthony Koppers presented updates on JRFB, which included:

- Major Achievements Since 2013
- Advantages of a Highly Streamlined Panel Structure
- Mandate and the Role of the JRFB
- Scheduling and Long-term JR Cruise Track
- *JOIDES Resolution* Schedule for FY 2019-2020
- Improvements in the JR Facility
- Special Oceanography Volume: Celebrating 50 Years Scientific Ocean Drilling

For more detailed information regarding this report, please see Dr. Koppers’ presentation, which is posted at [http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations](http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations)

2.2 *NSF Report*

NSF Program Manager, Dr. Jamie Allan, reviewed the key points of progress and/or change within the IODP. These included:

- FY2018 Budget: Overall Financial Situation appears stable
- JR Facility Review
- JR Facility Review Panel
• Panel Report and NSF Response
• JR Staffing
• JOIDES Resolution Facility Renewal
• NSF Seismic Solicitation
• Other NSF News

For more detailed information regarding this report, please see Dr. Allan’s presentation, which is posted at http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations

2.3 JR / IO Report
Dr. Mitch Malone, JRSO Liaison, presented highlights of the JR’s recent expeditions (371, 369, and 372). He also updated the attendees regarding:

• JOIDES Resolution Upcoming Expeditions
• JRSO Updates - Staff changes and Expedition Staffing

For more detailed information regarding this report, please see Dr. Malone’s presentation, which is posted at http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations

2.4 MSP / EFB, IO Report
Dr. Gilles Lericolais, ECORD Facility Board (EFB) Chair, and Dr. Sally Morgan, ECORD Science Operator (ESO) Liaison, presented a report on main EFB activities and Progress Update, which included:

• ECORD Facility Board Members (Science Board, Executive Board, and Funding Agencies)
• Mission-Specific Platform (MSP) Operational Plan 2013-23
• Mission-Specific Platform (MSP) Proposals at EFB
• Completed (2015-2017), Scheduled, and Proposed Expeditions
• Summary of MSP Proposals at SEP
• Expedition #364 Operational Review Committee (ORC) meeting summary
• Announcement of EFB meeting #6, March 6-7, 2018 in Venice, Italy

For more detailed information, please see Dr. Lericolais’ and Dr. Morgan’s presentations, which are posted at http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations

2.5 Chikyu / CIB, IO Report
Center for Deep Earth Exploration (CDEX) liaison, Dr. Nobu Eguchi provided the CIB (Chikyu IODP Board) and CDEX Report, which included:

• Next CIB Meeting – March 19-20, 2018 in Kobe
• Outlook of Chikyu Operation JPFY2017
• Chikyu operation Exp. 380 summary
• IODP Exp. 358 – Seismogenic/Slow Slip Megathrust
• Lord Howe Rise Project: Proposal 871 “Lord Howe Rise Continental Ribbon”
• Chikyu Mid-Term Plan
• Information on outcome of Special Exhibition “Deep Ocean 2017” (at the National Museum of Nature and Science)

For more detailed information, please see Dr. Eguchi’s presentation, which is posted at http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations
Dr. Holly Given, IODP Science Support Office (SSO) Executive Director, introduced the staff and summarized the:

- Confidentiality Policy and Panel Member Sign-in Requirement
- Science Support Office Services
- Update on the Cooperative Agreement Renewal
- New SSDB Package functionality
- Proposal Pool Statistics

For more detailed information, please see Dr. Given’s presentations, which is posted at [http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations](http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations)

4. Proposal Review and Advisory Process
Drs. Miller and Gulick (SEP Co-Chairs), provided a detailed review of panel procedures.

4.1 Review Procedures
Dr. Miller reminded those in attendance of their requirement to keep proposal content and discussion of all proposals confidential. He provided a brief summary regarding the SEP status and function,

Drs. Miller and Gulick then summarized proposal review procedures through:

- Highlights from the SEP Terms of Reference
- Results for the previous two SEP meetings
- Actions for panelists with Conflicts of Interest
- Rating of the proposal (after external review)
- Critical drilling plan review
- Characterizing Site Survey Data
- General data requirements and accepted formats (from the Guidelines)
- Classification System
- Watchdog (WD) responsibilities in preparing proposal reviews
- General evaluation criteria for IODP proposals
- Announcement of future SEP meetings

For detailed information, please see Dr. Miller and Dr. Gulick’s Review Procedure presentation, which is posted at [http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations](http://www.iodp.org/sep-presentations/sep-2018-january-presentations)

5. Review of Proposals

5.1 Revised Full Proposals
The SEP began their reviews of revised proposals.

17:00 Meeting Adjourned for the Day
The SEP continued their reviews of revised proposals.

5.2 Externally Reviewed Proposals
The SEP reviewed externally reviewed proposals.

Dr. Michael Gurnis gave a short science talk, in which he presented the results of Expedition 371: Tasman Frontier Subduction Initiation and Paleogene Climate.

5.2 Externally Reviewed Proposals (continued)
The SEP completed their reviews of externally reviewed proposals.

5.3 New Proposals
The SEP began their reviews of new proposals.

17:50 Meeting Adjourned for the Day

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>January 11, 2018</th>
<th>08:30-17:30</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

5.3 New Proposals (continued)
The SEP completed their reviews of new Full proposals and began their reviews of new Pre-proposals.

5.1 Revised Full Proposals (continued)
The SEP completed their reviews of revised proposals.

Dr. Christina Ravelo gave a short science talk, in which she presented the results of Expedition 363: Western Pacific Warm Pool.

5.3 New Proposals (continued)
The SEP completed their reviews of new Pre- and APL proposals.

6. Summary of SEP reviews
As summarized below, Dr. Miller and Dr. Gulick reviewed the results and ratings (as necessary) for each of the proposals discussed at this meeting.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposal ID</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>PI</th>
<th>title</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>853</td>
<td>Add (Full2)</td>
<td>Rosalind Coggon</td>
<td>South Atlantic Transect</td>
<td>Forward to JRFB with excellent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>859</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>Paul Baker</td>
<td>Amazon Margin Drilling</td>
<td>External Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>864</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>Tom Dunkley Jones</td>
<td>Equatorial Atlantic Gateway</td>
<td>Holding Bin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>866</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>Michael Strasser</td>
<td>Japan Trench Paleoseismology</td>
<td>External Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>874</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>Oliver Friedrich</td>
<td>Neogene Newfoundland Sediment Drifts</td>
<td>External Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>890</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>William Sager</td>
<td>Walvis Ridge Hotspot</td>
<td>Holding Bin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>892</td>
<td>Full2</td>
<td>Ross Parnell-Turner</td>
<td>Reykjanes Mantle Convection</td>
<td>Holding Bin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>909</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td>Paul Knutz</td>
<td>NW Greenland Glaciated Margin</td>
<td>Revise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>911</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td>Jim Wright</td>
<td>Argentine Marine Deep-Water Interactions</td>
<td>Revise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>919</td>
<td>Pre</td>
<td>Neil Mitchell</td>
<td>Late Cenozoic Pacific Internal Waves</td>
<td>Deactivate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Reviewer / co-chief commendations
The co-chairs asked for reviewer recommendations for 859 (Baker – Amazon Margin), 874 (Fredrichs – Newfoundland Drifts), and 866 (Strasser - Japan Trench) and for co-chief recommendations for 853 (South Atlantic Transect), 864 (Equatorial Atlantic Gateway), and 890 (Walvis Ridge).

8. SEP co-chair nomination
Dr. Gulick presented a list of three candidates that will go forward to the JRFB to replace Dr. Miller as SEP co-chair. The panel endorsed this list which is now with the JRFB for action. Depending on the final choice, the new co-chair’s first meeting will be either January 2019 or June 2019.

9. Schedule of next SEP meeting
The co-chairs announced that the next SEP Meeting is scheduled for 26-28 June 2018 in Potsdam, DE, and the group determined that the January 2019 meeting will be held 8-10 January 2019 in La Jolla, CA.

10. The panel thanked meeting host Holly Given and the SSO Staff, and the following members rotating off

- Steve Bohaty
- Marguerite Godard
- Marc-Andre Gutscher
- Helenice Vital

17:30 Meeting Adjourned